



23 January 2023

To: Prime Minister of Canada, Justin Trudeau  
Hon. Ahmed Hussen  
Hon. Carolyn Bennett  
Hon. Mark Holland  
Hon. Mary Ng  
Hon. Diane-Lebouthillier  
Hon. François-Philippe Champagne  
Hon. Marc Miller  
Hon. Pascale St-Onge  
Hon. Steven Guilbeault  
Hon. Joyce Murray  
Hon. Randy Boissonnault  
Hon. Dominic LeBlanc  
Hon. Gudie-Hutchings  
Hon. Sean Fraser

Cc: Hon. Marci Ien  
Hon. Salma Zahid  
Hon. Julie Dzerowicz

**Re: Recommendations of the Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration for a gender-responsive regularization program for undocumented people in Canada**

This letter provides recommendations by the Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration towards the commitment of the Federal Government to introduce a regularization program for undocumented people in Canada, as stated in Prime Minister Trudeau's mandate letter to the Minister of Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship (IRCC), Sean Fraser, on December 16, 2021.

The Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration is a network of people with lived experience, academics, advocates, and service providers across Canada who are actively working together to end discrimination against women and gender-diverse migrants. We conduct research, develop policy solutions, raise public awareness, and advocate for change by centering the voices of those with lived experience.

We urge you to adopt a regularization program that is equitable and inclusive to the particular vulnerabilities of women and gender-diverse people in Canada. Our recommendations will

support a national regularization program in line with the federal government's renewed commitment to Gender-based Analysis Plus (GBA+), an analytical framework introduced in 1995 to ensure legislation, policies, and programs, including within IRCC, are developed to reduce systemic inequalities related to gender and its intersecting identities, such as race, ethnicity, age, sexual orientation, and physical disability.

The evolving landscape of Canadian migration programs creates and maintains precarious immigration statuses that result in many people living in Canada falling out of status. The lack of pathways to permanent residence creates barriers to and challenges for equitable inclusion in Canadian society for women and gender-diverse individuals. Women and gender-diverse people who have been trafficked, who have come to Canada on a temporary work permit and who are employed in low-paid, precarious jobs, those who are refugee claimants, international students, or migrant sex workers, those who have been exploited by unscrupulous recruiters and immigration practitioners, and those who are in the process of family sponsorship but who have left their spouse due to domestic or gender-based violence often experience multiple oppressions and face unique challenges.

There has not been a coordinated response to the problem of status for women and gender-diverse individuals by stakeholders. These groups have specific needs. The Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration was formed to identify trends and promote policy solutions aimed at ending discrimination against women and gender-diverse migrants in Canada.

### **Need for a broad-based regularization program**

We urge you to implement a broad, gender-responsive, inclusive and rights-based regularization scheme that includes both a short-term regularization program and a longer-term plan and pathways to ensure women and gender-diverse individuals with precarious or no immigration status do not keep finding themselves without access to permanent residence status as a result of shortcomings in the design of Canada's immigration system. Any regularization program should reflect and address the range of situations experienced by migrant women and gender-diverse individuals and the intersection of gender, class, sexual orientation, migration status, gender identity, disability and age that contributes to their precarious immigration status. Given that many undocumented migrants and low-wage workers are racialized women and gender-diverse individuals, this emphasis aligns with the Federal Government's gender equity and anti-racism agendas.

Individuals lose their status for various reasons; for example, if their employment or studies are interrupted, their family sponsorship is withdrawn, a refugee claim is denied, or due to immigration policy and procedural issues like changes to eligibility requirements, delays or backlogs in processing, and high costs of immigration processes (Bhuyan et al., 2016; Tungohan, 2018). Undocumented migrants face unique challenges in Canada. Many have contributed to the Canadian economy for years, filling labor market shortages; yet their lapsed

immigration status makes them more vulnerable to abuse and less likely to exercise their rights.

### **Women and gender-diverse migrants face greater precarity**

Migrant women and gender-diverse individuals in Canada often face greater precarity than their male counterparts due to the nature of their work. Women, for example, are over-represented in low-paid occupations such as care work or cleaning that provide limited or no access to permanent residence. The pandemic has also pushed migrant women and gender-diverse individuals towards unemployment or precarious employment, intensifying the social, economic and health risks that they face.

Women and gender-diverse individuals without immigration status are often subject to poor working conditions, employer abuse, exploitation, gender-based violence, and the stress of living in constant fear of deportation. In addition to the numerous challenges navigating everyday life for undocumented women and gender-diverse migrants, a lack of authorization to engage in formal employment pushes people to work informally under precarious, unregulated, unsafe, and poorly compensated conditions (Hanley et al., 2020; Liew, 2020). People without status are not eligible for public health care coverage or social services and benefits, and therefore face barriers maintaining their health, and also face challenges with food and housing security (Kissoon, 2010; Magalhaes et al., 2010). For example, since the pandemic, of those who ended up unable to access abortion at all, the majority were undocumented individuals (Chabot, 2021). Similar barriers exist for those wishing to carry their pregnancies to term, but who are afraid or otherwise unable to access life-saving health services. This precarity can also be seen in the lives of children without formal status, whose families must navigate their precarious access to education and health care (Meloni et al., 2017; Rousseau et al., 2013).

Individuals without status and their families are under constant risk of detention and deportation (Abji, 2016; Basok et al., 2014; Moffette, 2021). This threat discourages them from interacting with official systems, even in cases where assistance is available, or the situation is life-threatening (for example, by calling the police, including to report incidents of gender-based violence). Despite not being included within the Canadian community of value, people without status play vital roles in their communities, form friendships and families, and engage in social, cultural, political, and economic life in Canada in enormous ways.

### **Structure of immigration programs lead to precarity**

The structures of some immigration programs render migrant women and gender-diverse individuals vulnerable to abuse. This is especially the case for migrant women who also live in their employer's home, such as most live-in care workers. The caps on the number of applications accepted through the Home Child Care Provider Pilot and Home Support Worker

Pilot (both programs accept up to 2,750 applications each year) mean that many migrant care workers waiting to apply for permanent residence are unable to do so because of a lack of space in the program, which also means prolonged family separation for care workers.

Women and gender-diverse individuals who are trafficked to Canada for forced labour are at heightened risk of losing their immigration status and becoming undocumented. They may discover that they lack proper work authorization despite assurances by employers and their agents that paperwork has been arranged. Being undocumented exacerbates their vulnerability to being forced to work without proper pay, work in unsafe conditions, or to being subjected to sexual harassment and assault in their workplaces or in their relationships with their employers. Systemic aspects of Canada's immigration system that place women and gender-diverse individuals in positions of vulnerability to gender-based violence and labour exploitation and many are unable to regain their immigration status in Canada.

## **Recommendations**

The Federal Government must prioritize broad-based accessibility to permanent status to ensure as many women and gender-diverse migrants as possible have access to a pathway to permanence in Canada, and in a timely manner. Many of these migrant women and gender-diverse individuals are workers who have worked in and continue to work in essential jobs that are integral to the economy. Essential workers deserve full status. It is the right thing to do.

In implementing any program, the Federal Government must consider the different aspects of immigration policies that affect migrant women and gender-diverse individuals, and in particular, those aspects that exclude or are too restrictive.

The Alliance proposes the following recommendations:

1. Implement a short-term regularization program for undocumented people. The program criteria should be clear and simple, and not discretionary to ensure applicants can determine quickly and easily if they qualify and can avoid putting themselves at risk by applying and not meeting the criteria. Procedural safeguards must be put in place to ensure that migrants are not at risk of deportation if they apply for such a program while their application is being processed. We note that a short term regularization program was implemented in Ireland in 2022. While we applaud how this program provided status to many, its four-year residency requirement excluded many others who needed it. For the many reasons outlined above, we strongly recommend that Canada's short-term regularization program be as broad and inclusive as possible.
2. Ensure long-term access to permanent resident status. In addition to a short-term regularization program, the Federal Government must create longer-term pathways to permanent residence that address the root causes that lead to precarious immigration status in Canada in the first place. For example, a lack of access to permanent

residence for most of Canada's farmworkers and others working in low-paid jobs leads to precarity and injustice for workers who may come to work in Canada for decades without any pathway to permanence.

3. New programs should not require language testing or onerous education requirements. Language testing creates an unnecessary barrier to workers who are already living in Canada and demonstrably able to communicate in one of Canada's two official languages, as do education requirements.
4. Regularization programs must include those who have been through the refugee determination system – whether their claims are pending or were refused. Refugee claimants contribute to Canada like any other migrant, and how they entered the country should not serve as a barrier to accessing any short- or long-term regularization program. In many cases, refugee claimants wait years to have their cases determined, all while working and contributing to the Canadian economy.
5. Immediate access to permanent residence for those experiencing gender-based violence or labour exploitation must be prioritized.
6. Repeal immigration regulations (e.g., ss. 183 (1) (b.1) and 196.1(a) of the *Immigration and Refugee Protection Regulations*) and Ministerial Orders pertaining to migrants without permanent status working in the sex industry and ease work permit restrictions for all temporary foreign workers as these restrictions lead to more precarity and a loss of immigration status without any justification.

We are requesting a meeting with you as soon as possible to discuss our proposal. Please contact Esel Panlaqui, National Coordinator of the Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration at (604) 669-4482 or esel@mwcbc.ca to establish a meeting.

Sincerely,

Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration

In addition to members with lived experience, the Alliance for Gender Justice in Migration is comprised of the following members:

British Columbia:

- Battered Women's Support Services
- Migrant Workers Centre
- Pacific Immigrant Resource Society
- West Coast Legal Education and Action Fund
- Radical Action with Migrants in Agriculture
- Dr. Asha Kaushal, University of British Columbia
- Dr. Geraldine Pratt, University of British Columbia

Manitoba:

- Immigration Partnership Winnipeg
- Manitoba Federation of Labour Occupational Health Centre
- Migrante Manitoba
- Dr. Shauna Labman, University of Winnipeg
- Dr. Sarah Zell, University of Winnipeg
- Dr. Lindsay Larios, University of Manitoba

Ontario:

- Barbra Schlifer Commemorative Clinic
- Butterfly
- FCJ Refugee Centre
- Legal Assistance of Windsor
- OCASI
- Rights of Non-Status Women's Network
- S4 Collective
- South Asian Women's Centre
- Fay Faraday, York University
- Dr. Judy Fudge, McMaster University
- Dr. Mary Jean Hande, Trent University

Quebec:

- Immigrant Workers Centre
- Dr. Jill Hanley, McGill University
- Dr. Delphine Nakache, University of Ottawa

## References

- Abji, S. (2016). "Because Deportation is Violence Against Women": On the Politics of State Responsibility and Women's Human Rights. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, 23(4), 483–507. <https://doi.org/10.1093/sp/jxw004>
- Basok, Bélanger, & Rivas. (2014). Reproducing Deportability: Migrant Agricultural Workers in South-western Ontario. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 40(9), 1394–1413. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2013.849566>
- Basok, T. (2000). He came, he saw, he...stayed. Guest worker programmes and the issue of non-return. *International Migration*, 38(2), 215–238. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-2435.00108>
- Basok, T., & Belanger, D. (2016). Migration Management, Disciplinary Power, and Performances of Subjectivity: Agricultural Migrant Workers' in Ontario. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 41(2), 139-. Gale OneFile: CPI.Q. [http://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A557578541/CPI?u=concordia\\_main&sid=zotero&xid=c4c0eb78](http://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A557578541/CPI?u=concordia_main&sid=zotero&xid=c4c0eb78)
- Bhuyan, R., Osborne, B. J., & Cruz, J. F. J. (2016). "Once You Arrive, Se Te Sala Todo" (Everything is Salted): Latina Migrants' Search for "Dignity and a Right to Life" in Canada. *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, 14(4), 411–431. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2020.1866978>
- Bhuyan, R., Valmadrid, L., Panlaqui, E. L., Pendon, N. L., & Juan, P. (2018). Responding to the Structural Violence of Migrant Domestic Work: Insights from Participatory Action Research with Migrant Caregivers in Canada. *Journal of Family Violence*, 33(8), 613–627. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10896-018-9988-x>
- Chabot, Frédérique, *Access to Abortion for Undocumented Persons during the COVID-19 Pandemic*, 28 July 2021.
- Fudge J, Ka Hon Chu, S., Lam, E. and Wong, V *Caught in the Carceral Web Anti-Trafficking Laws and Policies and their Impact on Migrant Sex Workers*, October 25, 2021.
- Goldring, L., Berinstein, C., & Bernhard, J. K. (2009). Institutionalizing precarious migratory status in Canada. *Citizenship Studies*, 13(3), 239–265. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020902850643>
- Hanley, J., Larios, L., Ricard-Guay, A., Meloni, F., & Rousseau, C. (2020). Pregnant and undocumented: Taking work into account as a social determinant of health. *International Journal of Migration, Health and Social Care*, 16(2), 189–199. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMHS-04-2019-0046>
- Kissoon, P. (2010). An Uncertain Home: Refugee Protection, Illegal Immigration Status, and their Effects on Migrants' Housing Stability in Vancouver and Toronto. *Canadian Issues*, 64–67.
- Larios, L. (2022). Precarious reproductive citizenship: Gaps in employment protections for pregnant precarious status migrants in Canada. *Citizenship Studies*, 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2022.2073970>
- Liew, J. C. Y. (2020). The Invisible Women: Migrant and Immigrant Sex Workers and Law Reform in Canada. *Studies in Social Justice*, 2020(14), 90–116. <https://doi.org/10.26522/ssj.v2020i14.2144>
- Magalhaes, L., Carrasco, C., & Gastaldo, D. (2010). Undocumented Migrants in Canada: A Scope Literature Review on Health, Access to Services, and Working Conditions. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 12(1), 132–151. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10903-009-9280-5>
- McDonald, J. (2009). Migrant Illegality, Nation-Building, and the Politics of Regularization in Canada. *Refuge*, 26(2), 65–77. <http://0-search.ebscohost.com/mercury.concordia.ca/login.aspx?direct=true&db=a9h&AN=60227075&site=eds-live>
- Meloni, F., Rousseau, C., Ricard-Guay, A., & Hanley, J. (2017). Invisible students: Institutional invisibility and access to education for undocumented children. *International Journal of Migration, Health and Social Care*, 13(1), 15–25. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMHS-01-2014-0001>
- Moffette, D. (2021). Immigration status and policing in Canada: Current problems, activist strategies and abolitionist visions. *Citizenship Studies*, 25(2), 273–291. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2020.1859194>
- Nyers, P. (2005). The Regularization of Non-Status Immigrants in Canada: Limits and Prospects. *Canadian Review of Social Policy*, 55, 109–114.
- Rousseau, C., Laurin-Lamothe, A., Rummens, J. A., Meloni, F., Steinmetz, N., & Alvarez, F. (2013). Uninsured immigrant and refugee children presenting to Canadian paediatric emergency departments: Disparities in help-seeking and service delivery. *Paediatrics & Child Health (1205-7088)*, 18(9), 465–469. <https://doi.org/10.1093/pch/18.9.465>

Tungohan, E. (2018). Living with Compromised Legal Status: Irregular Temporary Foreign Workers in Alberta and the Importance of Imagining, Strategizing, and Inter-Provincial Legal Consciousness. *International Migration*, 56(6), 207–220. <https://doi.org/10.1111/imig.12506>

Villegas, P. E. (2019). “I made myself small like a cat and ran away”: Workplace sexual harassment, precarious immigration status and legal violence. *Journal of Gender Studies*, 28(6), 674–686. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09589236.2019.1604326>